



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

SUMMARY REPORT OF THE MANHATTAN BOROUGH BOARD

March 16, 2017

In Attendance:

Presiding: Hon. Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President; Jessica Mates, Chief of Staff; Lucille Songhai, Director of Community Affairs; James Caras, General Counsel and Land Use Director; Basha Gerhards, Deputy Director of Land Use; Orlando Rodriguez, Urban Planner; Jefferson Mao, Urban Planner; Andrew Lombardi, Community Liaison

Council Members: Hon. Margaret S. Chin; Hon. Rosie Mendez; Hon. Daniel Garodnick; Hon. Helen Rosenthal; Hon. Mark Levin; Hon. Ydanis Rodriguez;

Community Boards: Anthony Notaro, Jr. (CB 1); Terri Cude (CB 2); Jamie Rogers (CB 3); Delores Rubin (CB 4); Vikki Barbero (CB 5); Rick Eggers (CB 6); Roberta Semer (CB 7); Jim Clynes (CB 8); Padmore John (CB 9); Brian Benjamin (CB 10); Diane Collier (CB 11); Shahabuddeen Ally (CB 12)

Members of the Public: Jeremy Crimm (representing Rep. Maloney); Stephanie Veras, Riders Alliance; Nick Sifuentes, Riders Alliance; Tabitha Decker, Transit Center; Myron Terry, Pfizer; Chris Collins, Capalino + Co.; Bob Tuttle, DCP; Ezra Moser, DCP; Judy Gallent, Bryan Cave LLP (representing Yale Club); Michael Slattery, REBNY; Joe Rosenberg, Catholic Community Relations Council; Peter Lempin, Grand Central Partnership; Mavianna Vaidman Stone (representing CM Garodnick); Rob Walker, (CB 4); Anthony Fabre, DCP; Stephanie Milvano (representing CM Rodriguez); Paul Westrick (representing Hon. Ben Kallos); Travis Terry, Capalino + Co.; Francisco Dial, TBA, INC.; Michael Stinton (representing Comptroller Stringer)

Minutes: Lesly Almanzar, Community Liaison

Agenda for March 16, 2017 Borough Board – Adopted
Minutes for February 23, 2017 Borough Board – Adopted

Presentation: BusTurnAround.nyc

Every day, New Yorkers take 2.5 million bus rides. Bus service is a vital element of New York City's public transportation network, reaching neighborhoods with



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

limited access to subways and often serving older, lower-income populations.

But the unfortunate reality for these New Yorkers is that our buses are slow and unreliable. The result has been declining bus ridership, even as our subways carry record numbers of riders: despite rapid population growth and an additional 500,000 jobs citywide, bus ridership has dropped 16% from 2002 to 2015.

Issues Bus Riders Face

- Bus routes often follow old streetcar lines that haven't been re-examined for decades.
- Traffic congestion and construction have led to declining bus average speeds; currently, buses run an average of 7.4 mph and often stuck in traffic.
- Bus "bunching", when two or more buses arrive simultaneously at a bus stop produce long lines at boarding and disembarking lengthens overall trip time.

The Bus Turnaround Coalition Recommends

- Redesigning the bus network and existing bus routes
- Transforming boarding on and off the bus
- Dedicated bus lanes
- Methods that keep buses on schedule
- Increased communication between bus drivers and dispatchers about delays

Bus Turnaround 2017 Priorities

- All-door boarding
- Transit signal priority
- Street priority for buses

In July 2016, the Bus Turnaround Coalition released a report, Turnaround: Fixing New York City's Buses, which highlighted current issues bus riders face and featured recommendations to make buses a reliable transit option.

Rubin (CB 4): Priority signaling is great, split signals are great, however, pedestrians don't understand these concepts. This may not be clear, and may not be effective in the heart of Midtown.

Riders Alliance: We see greater bus improvement being combined with Vision Zero initiatives and an educational component to inform and teach the public.



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

Rogers (CB 3): Can there be a transportation committee created to look deeper into problems and solutions? Chinatown has a lot of issues with inter-city buses taking up bus stands. Have you looked into how blocking bus lanes and stops contribute to bunching.

Riders Alliance: The campaign is pushing for stronger bus lane design and prioritizing buses. We are currently advocating at the state level to help keep bus lanes free and clear but not penalizing drivers.

Benjamin (CB 10): Buses never follow the schedule listed by MTA. Getting buses to hit target schedule time is necessary, it is a huge issue.

Riders Alliance: We are aware it's a major issue, priority is not that it comes at the exact time listed on the schedule, but that it's frequency is the same. Currently working on this issue but we need additional data from MTA. MTA, needs to increase transparency in order to complete this study. MTA now has an available bus time app, which is an improvement.

Ally (CB 12): There are collateral transportation issues when drivers, bikers and MTA buses share space, this also affects double parking and bus delay and causes congestions. There needs to be additional initiatives that affect the issues studied.

Riders Alliance: We researched ten areas that can be affected positively or negatively due to bus priorities while also considering wider streets, along with street traffic.

Collier (CB 11): CB 11 receives a lot of complaints about all the bus delays and request that this presentation be given at our CB 11 transportation committee. New construction and an increase of residents in the area affect bus ridership and schedule. This type of study should be included as part of an EIS or the ULURP process.

Cude (CB 2): MTA budget cuts were made and all busses will not have all door boarding. How can you prove with data that people are using the bus at any specific location and time. Spacing can increase speed but not service to people who need the services. CB 2 urges the campaign to continue to consider that many people that



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

take buses are disabled.

Riders Alliance: 65 million dollar will be cut from MTA Operating Budget statewide. The effect of this on MTA operations is that MTA buses will not be able to run using different options and/or bus routes.

CM Levin: Is there anything on Trump's budget that will affect this campaign? There is no mention of congestion pricing or possible solutions. Other organizations that support this campaign must raise awareness in order to build pressure to the State?

Riders Alliance; There is currently no movement on a State level to push this campaign along. We need the support from our electeds and transportation stakeholders on this end.

Office of Borough President Report

Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer: The office received over 1025 applications thus far for Community Board appointment. We will work with all Community Boards regarding funding advocacy as part of the Mayor's budget. Our Art Gallery will be dedicated and renamed for Maggi Payton, this will occur during our Women's History Month event later in the month.

We are currently working on legislation concerning:

- Car sharing
- Mandatory addresses on buildings We are partnering with Councilmember

Menchaca concerning a hearing on immigration. We have hosted bystander training partered with The Public Advocate's Office and Hollaback. We will continue to host more trainings as requested. We will host an event along with OATH on March 22th. We will host a faith based community and real estate community discussion on April 19th

Councilmember's Reports

Hon. Levin: As part of the budget, there are projected cuts to 150 parks employees which will have an impact on park operations. On Tuesday, March 21st, the City Council will hear testimony at the Parks Committee Hearing.



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

Hon. Rosenthal: I am currently working on passing legislation to enforce that buildings install special equipment in elevators that allows the blocking of white noise to accommodate people with hearing impairments. We are also working with DDC to include hearing loops in all future city construction. NYCHA has cut its youth chorus program, my office is urging you to reach out to NYCHA and advocate to bring back this program. I recently hosted an interfaith event rejecting hate, addressing the growing concerns of vandalism and swastikas drawn on doors. Funding and resources are needed for necessary social services, these institutions have been grossly underfunded.

Hon. Chin: New York City Council had a terrific turnout for Monday's Aging Committee Hearing. The Committee is asking for \$60 million to be added to budget towards senior resources. This is the Year of the Senior! My tenant safety bill will receive a new hearing next month. Affordable housing -100 units of senior housing coming soon at Essex Crossing. My office is working on senior housing and a park at Elizabeth Street. We want to see more affordable housing within the district as well as continued work at preserving affordable housing. My office is currently working on preferential rent issues, landlords double charging preferential rent amount targeting senior community.

Hon. Mendez: We are seeing more zoning issues in Community Board 5 due to historic changes in the district. My office has been working for 11 years on a BSA concerning an owner operating illegally within the district. The City Council held a preliminary budget hearing concerning housing where I asked questions concerning the HPD HFDC's regulatory agreement. HPD doesn't have the appropriate amount of staff to oversee this type of project/agreement. If this goes through they will not have the staff and people power to enforce this.

Hon. Rodriguez: Car-Free Day on Earth Day is scheduled for April 22, 2017. The goal is to encourage New Yorkers to decrease the amount of cars on the road to 1 million by the year 2030. The office is currently working with the support of City College who is leading the efforts and hosting a panel discussion about sustainability on Earth Day and I hope to see other institutions supporting this effort. The office is hoping that the City will close off 42nd Street down to 14th Street Broadway as well as 180th Street to 190th Street St. Nicholas Ave in support of our Car-Free event. The



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

office is currently working with academic institutions to have a summit of the state of immigrants in NYC. There needs to be a city-wide conversation, there is still a gap of the representation of minorities on leadership in the city. Summit will take place in June.

Community Board Reports

Community Board 1: CB 1 has a park being upgraded in the seaport. The design is 11 years old and outdated due to new construction and additional schools. CB 1 is calling on the Parks Department to stop the design of this park and encourage all boards to support this as we want new upgrades to have the benefit of new design and improvements.

Community Board 2: CB 2 is working on a group formed to address Pier 40, examining recreational priorities and retaining affordable housing. Multiple housing opportunities are needed for various types of people who live within the district. DOB needs to modify questions on their site and applications regarding multiple dwellings in different buildings for artists and others. DOB is a city agency who does not respond in a timely fashion. Permits are given out without process or investigation and there is seldom any real follow up. Landmarks are an issue CB 2 has not been receiving responses we would prefer to get.

Community Board 3: Four large towers are being proposed in waterfront areas. Transportation committee did not meet this month, but for the next meeting, we will meet to discuss bike lane issues in the area. There will be construction on Essex Street. CB 3 is launching social media platforms for the board and would like to compare notes on best ways to handle and engage on social media.

Community Board 4: CB 4 hosted an HDFC event, specifically inviting HDFC residents who live in the district to discuss the HPD proposed regulatory agreement. CB 4 hopes to come up with a united response. CM Johnson and CB 4 hosted a joint event last night, which Gale attended, thanks to the MBP for highlighting CB's and the CB application process. CB's should be the place to start the activism and they need more resources to be more effective.

GAB (MBP); Need more support from other boards in other boroughs.



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

Community Board 7: CB 7 passed a resolution on the immigration ban. CB 7 is working on a more creative approach on how to tackle the Mitchell Lama and affordable housing issue and recently hosted a presentation. CB 7 recently held a public housing task force meeting regarding \$3.5 million dollar budget cut to NYCHA in the district.

Community Board 8: Currently luxury high rises continue to be built in CB 8. Community is concerned about possible new development on 79th Street and 1st Ave. Esplanade waterfront committee will work on further improvements and more funding has been received. We are excited about being able to use the LINK kiosks to advertise CB events.

Community Board 9: CB 9's zoning resolution will identify the density and heights of buildings in Harlem. We are in the process of working with the Boys and Girls of Harlem to connect with youth using social media. CB 9 is struggling receiving information from DOT and DEP regarding issues we write to them about. CB 9 established some goals for 2017 including: Adapting discretionary funding for committees to host certain events, pairing up committees on overlapping issues and hosting joint events. CB 9 shares concerns regarding limited space to house schools and are looking for space for schools associated with Columbia University. The office is also working to assist small businesses facing rental increases and lease renewals. CB 9 will begin discussion about Citibike installation in the district.

Community Board 10: CB 10 needs help with bylaws regarding accepting public membership opportunities. Our "Let The Youth Speak" event was held this past Friday organized by members of our Youth and Education committee to address youth and community issues. CB 10 is working to understand the HDPC regulatory agreement proposal as well as fighting with real estate brokers renaming Harlem SOHA. CB 10 is hosting a legal clinic and will begin monthly legal clinics on-site concerning regulated housing issues.

Community Board 11: CB 11 has received \$20 million for library upgrades in the district. Currently working on having libraries open 7 days a week. CB 11 received a \$1 million neighborhood 360 grant from SBS for revitalization of businesses. Currently seeking funding for youth opportunity hubs to create opportunities for disconnected youth.. CB 11 is recognizing Gale as Woman of the Month on our



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

Facebook page.

Community Board 12: CB 12 is happy CB borough wide application process is almost complete and plans to utilize applicants not chosen as public members. Tonight CB 12 is cosponsoring a Town Hall regarding the George Washington Bus Terminal. The Inwood Public Library project is currently under heavy discussion. A lot of discussion is still ongoing regarding the 1 train elevator service at 181 Street. March 5th the community is invited to gather at Bennett Park to denounce hate as a unified front.

East Midtown Rezoning Vote:

Hon. Garodnick: Last plan provided more advantages for real estate than to the public. New plan has added more public improvements directly to the resolution. Plan has ability to allow landmark to transfer unused development rights with public participating. Funds will be for public use. East Midtown needs a refreshing look and better path to deliver zoning rules which will provide public with more benefits. How will landmark transfer dollars be used? We want the City to deliver public improvements asap. Concerns have been made by CB 5, 6, and the steering committee. These recommendations raised very real and important issues such as POP's not sufficiently studied by DCP. CB's have advocated the inclusion of POP's in the EIS.

A study is feasible and will be included in the EIS, I do think we are making sufficient progress to say that we support this process 100% at this moment while the remaining outstanding issues are being discussed. I am giving a conditional yes at this time and I am comfortable with this-until July.

Hon. Brewer: All CB's should contribute to the idea of this as if their own. The dollars of Midtown East is not going to be taxed, Midtown East is not receiving tax monies like all the other districts. 1 Vanderbilt is going up will produce millions in tax revenues.

Barbero (CB 5): Former task force aimed to improve public realm, current task force over 20 recommendations. CB 5 had a unanimous vote -to deny unless those conditions are met. At this time can they commit to anything more, such as:



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

- Increase density
- Improvement to MTA
- Landmark transfer rights
- Public realm/ peacemaking (biggest concern)
- Above grade -nothing no improvement public loses
- Super majority recommendation for 20-40 % of landmark revenue transfer to go to a private fund

Prohibition on as of right conversions of 12 FAR of nonresidential to commercial CPU disagreed with pops request, it's not feasible. However, now there is a last minute change to the POP's inclusion to EIS , which is in part in the right direction For board 5. There is a possibility of difference in a vote but not certain it will be a yes vote. CB 5 will be abstaining- proposal has now changed, vote was a hard no. Feeling too pressured to vote today.

Caras: Commitment we received from administration: Would study out and in open space on lots that are 40 or bigger.

Eggers(CB 6):A lot of the updates have occurred in the last 24 hours, CB 6 is prepared to vote today. Expect all issues raised on CB 6 resolution as the proposal moves forward, we are not softening our approach. When drafting our resolution we received assurances about POP's . CB 6 has 3 sites as well and residents are not feeling this their interests are priority. CB 6 wants to hear that their interests are primary and that the residential eastern part of the district is not commercial. 116/119 intersections will be adversely affected with this proposal. Light and air-came up late in the process concerned of setbacks on narrow streets and shadows cast on parks in CB 5 and 6. Concerns were raised of buildings meeting a certain standards of efficiency. CB 6 will be abstaining from voting. CB 6 does not want to get in the way of the process by voting no, however, is not ready to vote yes either since it would be a rushed decision and full board voted no before.

Hon. Garodnick: This is the beginning of the process and we will continue to move forward on making the recommendations possible. Voting yes

Caras: Let's review the 10 conditions:

- 1-4 deal with public realm issues
- 3rd Ave including limitation and changes to the Easter border.



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

- Residential conversions are an issue
- Shadow issues
- Floor pricing
- Continue to work to address all issues in resolutions
- All resolution goes to DCP this does not supplant what CB's are asking for.
- Deadline is the ULURP process deadline
- CB resolutions and recommendations go to City Planning

Hon. Brewer: Yes

Hon. Chin: Yes

Hon. Mendez: Yes

Hon. Garodnick: Yes

Hon. Rosenthal: Yes

Hon. Levin: Yes

Hon. Rodriguez: Yes

Barbero (CB 5): Abstain

Rick Eggers (CB 6): Abstain

Clynes (CB 8): Yes

Borough Board adjourned.