SUMMARY REPORT OF THE MANHATTAN BOROUGH BOARD

June 15, 2017

In Attendance:

Presiding: Honorable Gale A. Brewer, Manhattan Borough President, Jessica Mates, Chief of Staff; Aldrin Bonilla, Deputy Borough President; Matthew Washington, Deputy Borough President; Lucille Songhai, Director of Community Affairs; Andrew Chang, Community Liaison to Manhattan Community Boards 1 and 2; Lesly Almanzar, Community Liaison to Manhattan Community Boards 6 and 12; Diana Howard, Community Liaison to Manhattan Community Boards 7 and 9

Council Members: Eric Bottcher, Chief of Staff, Council Member Corey Johnson; Jasmine Askew, Community Aide, Council Member Mendez

Community Boards: Anthony Notaro, Jr. (CB 1); Terri Cude (CB 2); Jamie Rogers (CB 3); Vikki Barbero (CB 5); Rick Eggers (CB 6); Roberta Semer (CB 7); Daniel Dornbaum (CB 8); Padmore John (CB 9); Cicely Harris (CB 10); Debbie Quinones (CB 11); Shahabuddeen Ally (CB 12)

Minutes: Brian Lafferty, Special Projects Liaison

Agenda for June 15, 2017 Borough Board – Adopted

Minutes for May 18, 2017 Borough Board – Adopted

Presentation: WordPress, BoardTrack, and Board Stat

Presenters: Noel Hidalgo, BetaNYC and Emily Goldman, BetaNYC

Noel Hidalgo, Beta NYC: BetaNYC is a non-profit organization dedicated to using technology, data, and design to improve civic engagement New York City. We have joined Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer in the fight to improve transparency in New York City government through open data and we worked with Gale on the New York City Transparency Working Group. In 2015, BetaNYC assumed leadership of the Civic Innovation Fellowship at Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer's Office. The Civic Innovation Fellowship is offered to members of the CUNY Service Corps. It is funded by the City University of New York and is supported by Data and Society, an open access, think/do tank that is focused on social, cultural, and ethical issues arising from data-centric technological development, and the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation, which funds research and education in science, technology, engineering, mathematics and economics. Since 2015, BetaNYC has trained 29 fellows in how to use open data and it has created 7 hours of video tutorials (accessible on the BetaNYC YouTube Page) on how to use open data. We are updating the

CartoDB tutorial this summer, but the core curriculum is still on YouTube. We have also produced a 100 page workbook for using open data. In working with open data, we discovered challenges with the 311 dataset, which led us to collaborate with 311and the Mayor's Office of Data Analytics to improve data quality, access and usability. Last year, our Civic Innovation Fellows performed a gap analysis for community boards to see how community board offices can most effectively manage and collect their own data as well as engage in data analysis of the City's open data for their respective communities. BetaNYC, the Manhattan Borough President's Office and Civic Innovation Fellows identified three project areas and conceptualized, created and tested three applications with community boards. We thank the community boards for taking a leap of faith with us and for their time as we interviewed them and worked to incorporate their feedback, which has been very helpful, into the applications. The first application we tested with community boards is WordPress, which is an open source content management system which makes the web content creation process simpler. Citywide, there are eleven community boards using WordPress and, in Manhattan, there are five community boards using WordPress. Since February, BetaNYC and Civic Innovation Fellows have interviewed four of the five Manhattan community boards using WordPress on their practices and we are working with DOITT to ensure that community boards' needs are met. By the end of this summer, the City is going to roll out a unified WordPress platform solution. The Manhattan Borough President's Office website is moving to a WordPress platform as well. In short, the City needs to support a multitude of interfaces and allow for flexibility with templates. Currently, website plug-ins are limited by the server that DOITT has.

Emily Goldman, Beta NYC: BoardTrack is a standardized practice of attendance tracking. It's built off of Manhattan Community Board 11's existing tracking tool for attendance. It allows for late arrival and early departure attendance tracking. Two community boards have tested it. As you can see, the names of board members are in alphabetical order and we have populated it with the new members' names from the updated roster.

Shahabuddeen Ally, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 12: Is BoardTrack meant to be done live or can attendance be recorded on paper first?

Noel Hidalgo, Beta NYC: BoardTrack has three components. First, it will require updated bylaws regarding attendance. Second, it will include a way to track attendance (which could be the interface we created or it could be a paper attendance sheet), and third, it will include the spreadsheet/interface itself to record attendance. Essentially then, it is a methodology to increase data around attendance – attendance can be input directly into it online or attendance can be tracked on paper first and entered into it online at a later time.

Aldrin Bonilla, Deputy Borough President: This raises more questions than answers. I know you're asking who will be in charge of recording attendance through BoardTrack. Each board will have to develop a best practice around it. As we read the bylaws and the charter, we have to make sure that they are consistent with BoardTrack. We are going to revisit this. Our office has been collecting attendance once or twice a year from the twelve boards and each board uses a different format and some boards use different formats at different times.

Roberta Semer, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 7: Is there a way to record excused absences?

Emily Goldman, BetaNYC: Yes. In BoardStat, absences can be recorded as excused or unexcused.

Terri Cude, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 2: Is there a way to note if an absence is with or without notice, because whether or not an absence is with notice says a whole lot about that member's commitment.

Emily Goldman, BetaNYC: No, but that's exactly the kind of feedback we're looking for. We can incorporate that.

Aldrin Bonilla, Deputy Borough President: There's even a way to check if there is quorum.

Anthony Notaro, Jr., Chair, Manhattan Community Board 1: Is this available now?

Aldrin Bonilla, Deputy Borough President: Yes, but this is the first version and we will have to discuss how best to roll it out to each board.

Noel Hidalgo, BetaNYC: If you're interested in signing up to join our Civic Innovation Steering Committee, please do so on the paper that I'm passing around. We'll speak with each member who signs up about rolling it out to their respective boards and customizing it for their respective boards.

Emily Goldman, BetaNYC: BoardStat is a simple 311 data analytics tool that will be customized for each board. Over the last several months, we explored a number of options and platforms including Excel, Charts.js and Tableau. Ultimately, we decided to partner with Microsoft Civic to develop the tool with PowerBI. Let's turn to the demos. This is what BoardStat looks like. It opens in your web browser. We have links ready for everyone. Here, I've pulled up Manhattan Community Board 3 to give you a walkthrough. So what we see here are the top ten complaints types, broken down into their descriptors. In the 311 dataset, we have complaint type and then we have a subset of complaint type, which is called a complaint descriptor. Complaint descriptors give you more information about what the complaint is about. So, for instance, if we look at the "Noise – residential" complaint type bar in the bar graph, there are complaint descriptors including "loud music/party." In this time frame -right now the time frame set is all 311 data available from the

beginning of 311 in 2010 to yesterday, June 12th (311 data is updated each night) – we can see that the top or greatest complaint type (in terms of number of complaints) is "Noise – Residence." However, we can change the date range to whatever period we would like. Let's say we wanted to look at the past year and a half. The bar chart will change to show the top 10 complaint types for the period we have selected and so does everything else on the page (i.e. 1.) the complaint type descriptor data table, 2.) the incident address and complaint count data table and 3.) the map of complaints.)

Anthony Notaro, Jr., Chair, Manhattan Community Board 1: Where is the data from?

Emily Goldman, BetaNYC: The data is from the open data portal, it is 311 data. So now we've changed our date range to look only at the past year and a half (1/1/2016 to 6/12/2017). We have our top 10 complaint types and descriptors in the bar graph in the upper left hand corner of the first page of the interface. Each bar in the graph represents a complaint type and is itself broken down by complaint type descriptor for which it is color coded. We have a data table in the upper right hand corner of the first page of the interface with the complaint type, complaint type descriptor, and the count of complaints in descending order and we have a data table with incident addresses with the greatest number of complaints and the counts of their complaints in descending order in the bottom left hand corner of the first page of the interface. Finally, we have a map of complaints in the bottom right hand corner of the first page of the interface. We'll show you the usability of the map at a later stage. When you click a bar in the bar graph (which represents a top complaint type), in the upper left hand corner of the interface, the data changes to reflect just that complaint type and its descriptors. From the district managers that we met with, we heard that they really wanted to be able to plug in an address and see its complaints. Consequently, the second page of the interface is an address lookup page. We'll look at 322 East 11th Street as an example. In the bottom left hand corner of the second page of the interface, we see a diagram with the number of requests by complaint types. On the top half of the second page of the interface, we see a data table with the date of each complaint filed, the date that it was closed, the incident address, the complaint type, the complaint descriptor, the agency responsible for the complaint and the resolution description for that complaint. Finally, in the bottom right hand corner of the second page of the interface, we see a line graph with the number of 311 requests by year. The third page of the interface allows us to explore a complaint type and/or its descriptors by month and year in a bar graph by selecting a date range, complaint type, and complaint descriptor. All 150 complaint types are available in the drop down menu for selection. The fourth page of the interface allows us to see top complaint types and their descriptors over the course of the months for a particular year of interest. You can take a closer look at a particular complaint type's descriptors for more information. The fifth page of the interface is an agency profile page. We've heard from the District Service Cabinet meetings, where the agencies are present, that community boards would like to see

what types of complaints and service requests are channeled to each City agency, whether these complaints and service requests have been closed, and how many days on average these complaints take to be closed by agencies. So we can choose a particular agency and a created date range for complaints and service requests and see which complaints have been assigned, closed, open, pending or started (these are the different statuses or stages each complaint or request type can be in). If we select a particular agency, then the data table on the bottom half of the fifth page will just be complaint types and descriptors for that agency. In addition to displaying the complaint types and descriptors, the data table on the bottom half of the fifth page also shows the status, the count of complaints, and the average days it takes the agency to close that complaint type and descriptor. So that is the overview of BoardStat. I also want to show you two more use cases for BoardStat. We've also heard from District Managers that noise relating to liquor licenses is a concern. Using BoardStat we can zero in on the "Noise – Commercial" complaint type, which is noise coming from bars and restaurants and the like. On the first page of the interface, looking at Manhattan Community Board 8, with data from 2010 to the present, we can see that there are more than 8,000 "Noise – Commercial" complaints and that 1134 First Avenue has 183 of these "Noise – Commercial" complaints. On the second page of the interface, we can then plug in and search for complaints from 1134 First Avenue. Heat and hot water complaints is another concern or use case that may be of interest, particularly in Manhattan Community Board 12. On the first page of the interface we can see that 34 Arden Street has the greatest number of complaints within Manhattan Community Board 12 at over 14,480 complaints and that of these complaints are heat and hot water complaints. That's what we have so far. We would love to have more feedback from you all. Before I go away, I am going to pull up BoardTrack. Here we have Manhattan Community Board 7. It's populated with all of the current Manhattan Community Board 7 members' names. There's a drop down menu within each cell of BoardTrack with the options of Present, Late Arrival, Early Departure, Excused Absence, and Unexcused Absence.

Padmore John, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 9: So this is also for each of the committees?

Emily Goldman, BetaNYC: Great question. We have tabs for each of the committees, but we need your help to populate these committees with the committee member names and to confirm the names of the committees. So if you give us the lists of the committees and the member names for each committee we can populate BoardTrack for your community boards.

Padmore John, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 9: So this is a Google Doc?

Emily Goldman, BetaNYC: Yes, this is a Google Sheet. We need to deal with the permission issues and such, but otherwise it is available.

Padmore John, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 9: So committee chairs can enter attendance on their phone, tablet, or computer at each of their committee meetings.

Noel Hidalgo, BetaNYC: So the intent is to work within your existing workflow. We've heard that there are existing attendance practices, which includes tracking attendance on paper first, so this is designed to complement that. This is not a tool that we can just launch today because we want to customize it so that it works within your workflow. Consequently, we are asking each of you as Board Chairs, if you are interested in this, to sign up for the Civic Innovation Steering Committee so that we can continue improving this product and make sure that it works within your workflow.

Anthony Notaro, Jr., Chair, Manhattan Community Board 1: Going back to BoardStat, have you thought about putting it on community board websites so that others can see it?

Emily Goldman, BetaNYC: That's a great question and yes, a number of people that we have spoken with have said it would go well with WordPress and that they would like to embed it within their community board websites.

Anthony Notaro, Jr., Chair, Manhattan Community Board 1: Could you help us do that?

Noel Hidalgo, BetaNYC: Yes. The first step is to roll out these dashboards to all twelve boards and chairs so that you and your boards can start looking at 311 data and provide feedback so that we can increase its utility so that it makes sense for you, your board members, and your committees and enables you to hold agencies accountable. Once we have that figured out, then we can start to talk about putting it up on community board websites so that the general public can use it. We want to make sure that it works for you and your board members, first and foremost, and then share it with the your communities and the public. The idea is that BoardStat would exist at least on the Borough President's website so that anyone who wanted to access BoardStat data can do just that. We need to figure out a few things first and then we can get to putting it up online for the general public.

Rick Eggers, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 6: I can say that we've looked at this. We had a nice demonstration on this. I love this. I'm hoping that it's not extra work for the board office, which is always a concern. It's just wonderful. For BoardStat, can you put in a range of addresses in order to capture a neighborhood?

Emily Goldman, BetaNYC: That's a great question. That's exactly the kind of feedback that we are looking for. Not yet, but maybe we could draw boundaries on a map, use zip codes, or geocodes to do that. Zip codes are already within the 311 dataset.

Rick Eggers, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 6: We'd like to be able to report to particular neighborhood or block associations about the 311 complaints and service requests within their respective areas and track these issues for them.

Aldrin Bonilla, Deputy Borough President: As you work with BoardStat, you will have feedback to share and it will change your understanding of the work. Each community board, as you can see, has different concerns and being able to drill down by address and agency allows us to change the structure of the conversation and zero in on the most important issues. The Manhattan Borough President's Office can use this to see what letters we should write to agencies on behalf of constituents. The 311 dataset on its own is available for you, but it's not user-friendly so BetaNYC and its Civic Innovation Fellows have made it user-friendly for each community board with their BoardStat application.

Noel Hidalgo, BetaNYC: DOITT and 311 are going through a multi-million dollar redesign and IBM is rolling out a new CRM for 311. I have looked at the contract, which identifies the agencies it will be used for, and community boards and elected officials are certainly two groups of stakeholders that can use the data it collects. DOITT and 311 recognize that this redesign and CRM will provide an opportunity to community boards and elected officials. We have demoed BoardStat for DOITT and 311 and they have expressed interest in building it in to the CRM. Consequently, we have an opportunity to influence the CRM with your feedback. Your feedback will help 311 change the way it collects this data so that it collects it in a way that enables community boards and stakeholders to be more efficient. I now have the contact information from 11 of the 12 Manhattan community boards. We will be following up with you because we need you to help us help you. We don't want to burden you. We know you have a lot of commitments, but we need your feedback because it's the only way that we can improve these tools. You can assign this to your board members and staff. To recap, these are three tools that we have been working on. We want to follow-up with you on them as we develop them. Finally, in our work, we have been able to identify techniques for teaching how to use the data and understand the terminology that 311 has created to help get you oriented to the 311 dataset.

Aldrin Bonilla, Deputy Borough President: Next week on Friday, June 23rd we have a training symposium and BoardStat will be presented to those who attend it.

Community Board Chair Report Outs

Aldrin Bonilla, Deputy Borough President: Brian Benjamin was elected to represent the 30th District in the New York State Senate and Manhattan Community Board 10 has elected Cicely Harris as its new Chair. We congratulate Senator Benjamin and welcome Chair Harris to the Borough Board.

Shahabuddeen Ally, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 12: I want to thank Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer for appointing Community Board 12's first 16 year old member this year. We are happy to have him on board. I saw the Borough President's supermarket report on my way in and I want to thank the Borough President for her work on it and for her assistance in the successful effort to save the Associated Supermarket in Community Board 12. There's a private ULURP application that was certified in Community Board 12. Community Board 12 now has sixty days to review it. These next sixty days include our recess period, according to the Department of City Planning. It is for two townhouses, but it will be an indicator of what is to come. We have two other major projects that will come before Community Board 12 in the near future.

Debbie Quinones, Vice Chair, Manhattan Community Board 11: Manhattan Community Board 11 has welcomed a new Assistant District Manager, Thomas Herrera, who is enthusiastic about his new position. Manhattan Community Board 11 has major ULURPs and a rezoning on the horizon. Manhattan Community Board 11 has a biweekly rezoning task force which has been meeting for the past several months and has allowed for community input. Manhattan Community Board 11 looks forward to its new members' involvement and its chair, Diane Collier, has reached out to its new members and begun to orient them to the work of the board.

Cicely Harris, Manhattan Community Board 10: After Senator Brian Benjamin's election, Manhattan Community Board 10 had an election for chair. I was elected Chair, Charles Powell was elected 2nd Vice Chair, and our 2nd Vice Chair John Lynch became our 1st Vice Chair. Manhattan Community Board 10 welcomed our new members and a new Community Associate, Isaiah Jenkins. On June 3rd, Manhattan Community Board 10, the New York Junior League, and the Department of Parks and Recreation hosted a ribbon cutting for Jackie Robinson Park's latest playground improvement project. Manhattan Community Board 10 Parks Chair, Karen Horry attended and was grateful for everyone's involvement in making the project a success.

Padmore John, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 9: Manhattan Community Board 9 would like to thank Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer appointing new members. Manhattan Community Board 9 will review its bylaws and hold elections for executive officers later today. Manhattan Community Board 9 has just transitioned to a WordPress website. It will be holding meetings with Union Theological Seminary on housing and working with both NYCHA and Manhattan Community Board 7 on public housing issues. Manhattan Community Board 9 was introduced to Justfix.nyc to help tenants obtain repairs and it is promoting the site to the community. Finally, Manhattan Community Board 9's Arts and Culture held its School and Teaching Artists' Expo, which helps informs artists on how they may become teaching artists in public and private schools.

Honorable Gale A. Brewer, Manhattan Borough President: My Northern Manhattan Office had a forum on Justfix.nyc on May 4th.

Daniel Dornbaum, Secretary, Manhattan Community Board 8: Manhattan Community Board 8 tabled at the Lenox Neighborhood House - Second Avenue Street Fair and it will have members table at several additional street fairs this summer. Manhattan Community Board 8 welcomed seven new members at its meeting last night and will have a new member orientation where each committee chair spoke about his/her committee's work. Finally, Manhattan Community Board 8 had a forum regarding the proposed development at the corner of East 86th Street and Lexington Avenue in which the developers, the Department of Transportation, and the MTA spoke. In response, Manhattan Community Board 8 has launched a task force that will meet on a regular basis to monitor the project.

Roberta Semer, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 7: Manhattan Community Board 7 has five new members and each of them will work with a mentor. Manhattan Community Board 7 had a meeting with the new members and their mentors. Manhattan Community Board 7 has also been working with three people who applied, but were not appointed to the board. One of these applicants is working with Manhattan Community Board 7's Communications Committee to develop an Instagram page and the other two applicants are working with Manhattan Community Board 7's Transportation Committee. This evening there will be a hearing on the American Museum of Natural History's Draft Environmental Impact Statement. Next week, the Department of Housing Preservation and Development and the West Side Federation for Senior and Supportive Housing will host a scoping session on the West Side Federation for Senior and Supportive Housing's proposal to acquire a building and three City-owned garages to create a supportive housing development on West 108th Street. Finally, Manhattan Community Board 7 is trying to look at guidelines for secondary street names and I wanted to know if other community boards had guidelines for secondary street namings.

Vikki Barbero, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 5: Manhattan Community Board 5 does not do secondary street namings.

Terri Cude, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 2: I will send you Manhattan Community Board 2's secondary street naming guidelines.

Rick Eggers, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 6: Manhattan Community Board 6 began a public hearing last night on a proposed zoning text amendment to downzone the Sutton Place area. This hearing will continue next week and Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer will be joining us. Although the Department of City Planning is not in favor of this proposed downzoning, the majority of the Sutton Place community is in support. The hearing was originally scheduled for July,

but since there is a 90 story building proposed for Sutton Place, this has accelerated the pace of the community's effort to downzone the area. Manhattan Community Board 6 has hired two consultants to begin work next week and they will continue their work for the remainder of the year since one staff member is on maternity leave and another has resigned. Manhattan Community Board 6 has six new board members (a seventh was appointed, but was not able to serve). I introduced the new board members to the board last night. The new members have also met with their mentors and they will receive training from their mentors over the summer. Manhattan Community Board 6 welcomed a new 16 year old appointment to replace another member who was 16 at her appointment and is leaving to attend Harvard. Manhattan Community Board 6 is looking forward to migrating its website to WordPress. Recently, Manhattan Community Board 6's website crashed and only one board member knew how to fix it so it was down for a couple of weeks. Manhattan Community Board 6 has some bylaws which need tweaking, specifically regarding elections and how we discuss particular types of information, but I understand that there is an effort to have more uniform bylaws across community boards being made by the Manhattan Borough President's Office so I want to time the bylaws amendment so that Manhattan Community Board 6 does not have to amend its bylaws and then amend them again shortly thereafter. After this meeting, I will be attending a ribbon cutting at Stuyvesant Square Park to celebrate the completion of a fence restoration around its perimeter which has taken thirty years – largely because the funding was not there. However, in the past several years, the support of Council Member Rosie Mendez, Council Member Dan Garodnick and Comptroller Scott Stringer (when he was Borough President) has finally made it a reality. The fence was reconstructed to be a historically accurate reproduction of the original 19th-Century fence.

Vikki Barbero, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 5: Manhattan Community Board 5 has welcomed thirteen new members and will welcome a fourteenth new member soon. Manhattan Community Board 5 had an orientation for new members and an election for Executive Officers. On Tuesday, June 13th Manhattan Community Board 5 had a final hearing on the East Midtown Rezoning. Manhattan Community Board 5 also considered an application from the Department of Transportation for the temporary closure of two blocks of Broadway between 36th and 40th Streets to vehicular traffic. It will be a pilot program for June, July, and August of this year. Since there is a low volume of motor vehicles in that area during the summer months and a lack of open space with an exceptionally high volume of pedestrian traffic, the Department of Transportation and the Times Square Alliance proposed this closure to vehicular traffic and the temporary installation of twelve food kiosks in this location. Business access will be allowed and signage will encourage bicyclists to walk their bikes. In addition, there will be stone benches, street seats, turf boxes, movable furniture, and artwork at this location. The Department of Transportation and the Times Square Alliance are partnering to create programming and provide maintenance of the space. The Department of Transportation will study of the effects of the temporary closure to vehicular traffic and report its

findings to Manhattan Community Board 5. This proposal has had a lot of public support. However, commercialization of public space was a concern in the vote to approve the application so it just barely passed and was almost a split vote. Manhattan Community Board 5 has put out a statement on this which I will read: "Although Manhattan Community Board 5 has strong concerns regarding the best use of these public spaces and recognizes the potential for abuse of these public spaces by the proposed commercial uses, Manhattan Community Board 5 supports efforts to creatively share street space and improve vehicular, bicycle, and pedestrian traffic flow - as well as efforts to improve the aesthetics of the New York City streets - and believes that the applicants proposed trial program fulfills these goals." Manhattan Community Board 5 has a precedence of supporting the work of its committees, including its Transportation Committee. Although this application came out of the Transportation Committee with a unanimous vote, it led to a contentious full board vote and a forty-five minute full board discussion. Consequently, it is clear that people are really concerned about commercialization of our public spaces. Manhattan Community Board 5 has also seen a proliferation of rooftop cafes/bars and noise complaints and it has had two new rooftop café/bar applications this month. Manhattan Community Board 5 is concerned by what it considers to be a lack of enforcement of rooftop café/bar regulations from SLA, DEP, and NYPD. New York State Comptroller Thomas DiNapoli's Office issued a report entitled "The SLA's Responsiveness to Noise," which has found the SLA to be ineffective in its response to noise complaints. It found that the NYPD needs to enhance its recordkeeping, develop a formal system-wide procedure to follow up on establishments with a high volume of complaints – including periodic communications with the SLA, – and formally assess the effectiveness of its actions taken to mitigate persistent noise problems. Moreover, it found that the SLA should develop a formal process to access and analyze 311 noise complaint data and develop a formal communication protocol with the NYPD. Finally, Manhattan Community Board 5 believes that elected officials need to be involved and to pass new legislation to address noise from bars and rooftop cafes and bars.

Honorable Gale A. Brewer, Manhattan Borough President: We are looking for a new SLA member right now to represent Manhattan so if you have any ideas, please send them to me immediately. We will look to see if there was a community board applicant who was not appointed to a community board, but who has qualifications for the position.

Aldrin Bonilla, Deputy Borough President: I remember that in the 311 data set that rooftop café/bar noise was a complaint type descriptor.

Manhattan Community Board 4 Chair Dolores Rubin was not present and did not send a representative.

James Rogers, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 3: Manhattan Community Board 3's Public Housing Subcommittee met and discussed two important things related to NYCHA. One was FEMA

funding for coastal resiliency work along the NYCHA waterfront campuses. The other was a NextGen NYCHA project on the La Guardia campus. NYCHA has proposed constructing an infill housing development that will be 50% affordable housing (and 50% of these affordable units will house people living in the development) and 50% market rate housing on the La Guardia campus. NYCHA states that this development will help it to address the $70 million backlog in repairs for La Guardia Houses. In addition, Manhattan Community Board 3's Economic Development Committee had a well-attended meeting to discuss a proposed special zoning district to help preserve small businesses in the East Village area of Manhattan Community Board 3. The community is concerned by the number of small businesses that have closed and been replaced by big box and chain stores. Manhattan Community Board 3 is looking into how it can address this phenomenon with land use and zoning regulations. The New York State Department of Health held a hearing regarding Mount Sinai Beth Israel's proposed move from Manhattan Community Board 6 to Manhattan Community Board 3 where they presented their findings regarding the proposed move and reduction in services and number of beds. Manhattan Community Board 3's Health and Human Services Committee is still examining this very technical matter. Last night, Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer joined Manhattan Community Board 3 for a meeting to discuss a parcel of land that is City-owned on the South side of 14th Street, which is currently a PC Richards, that Mayor de Blasio believes could become a tech hub with high-paying jobs and a gateway to entrepreneurial success in the new tech economy. However, many residents are concerned about the zoning of Third and Fourth Avenues and would like to consider a simultaneous downzoning of the Third and Fourth Avenue corridors with the tech hub land use application. Finally, Manhattan Community Board 3 has nine new members who I have been meeting with one-on-one.

Terri Cude, Chair, Manhattan Community Board 2: Manhattan Community Board 2 has six new members, including a 16 year old member and I have met with them. Manhattan Community Board 2 is working on committee assignments for all of its board members. Manhattan Community Board 2's challenges continue to include liquor license applications. The SLA is not looking at 311 data and recently informed one of our SLA Committee chairs that, if they do not receive a 311 complaint, they do not respond. Consequently, Manhattan Community Board 2 is setting up a mechanism that sends 311 complaints to the SLA. Manhattan Community Board 2 is always working on land use issues. Affordable housing is being lost and there are many issues with schools in Community Board 2. Preserving open space and addressing quality of life issues, including late night deliveries in mixed use areas that are making it difficult for residents to sleep, is of utmost concern to Manhattan Community Board 2. Regarding transportation, poor subway service, a lack of buses, and access-a-ride are issues that Manhattan Community Board 2 is addressing. Finally many small, local businesses in Manhattan Community Board 2 are being replaced by pop-ups which use the sidewalk as retail space and oversized stores with experiential events indoors and long lines outdoors on the sidewalk. In fact, many new oversized chain stores are pointing to existing

oversized chain stores that are not in compliance with zoning and lack necessary special permits – essentially saying that, if they can do it, why can't we. So we are responding that they are illegal as well. DOB has issued ECB violations, which then go to OATH. So far three of the six stores with ECB violations have gone to OATH. One did not show up at OATH, two were postponed until August, and the other three have never been moved forward. Manhattan Community Board 2 is concerned that OATH will only issue a small fine against the stores and not actually work to bring them into compliance. Some oversized chain stores have become creative and have found interesting loopholes. For instance a lingerie store might sell some tennis balls so that it may be classified as a sporting goods store, which is permitted under the zoning. I would like to thank Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer for her denial of an application that would allow 45,000 square feet of retail space at 462 Broadway and for her decision not to change the zoning of the Special Little Italy District. In short, Manhattan Community Board 2 is trying to keep its neighborhoods from becoming only shopping destinations for visitors as opposed to livable communities.

Anthony Notaro, Jr., Chair, Manhattan Community Board 1: Recently rooftop cafes/bars have become a major problem in Manhattan Community Board 1. We have had two rooftop cafe/bar applications in the last month and they are very difficult to sort out in terms or rules and guidelines and hours of operation. Manhattan Community Board 1 is working on migrating its website to WordPress as well and would like to thank Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer for appointing five new community board members. I have contacted the new members and next week I will introduce them to our Executive Committee at a reception. Regarding Battery Park City, Manhattan Community Board 1 has worked with Assembly Member Yuh-line Niou, Assembly Member Deborah Glick and State Senator Daniel Squadron to introduce legislation to amend Battery Park City's Charter so that two residents of Battery Park City are on the Board of Battery Park City. Right now, the Board of Battery Park City is not representative of the Battery Park City Community. Two constant concerns of Manhattan Community Board 1 are coastal resiliency and improvements to both traffic flow and livability, particularly in the Financial District. Regarding coastal resiliency, we are still working with Ahmed Tigani, Assistant Director, Land use, Planning and Development, at Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer's Office. I will be meeting this afternoon with the Downtown Alliance regarding traffic and pedestrian issues in Lower Manhattan and walking through a study area around the New York Stock Exchange for which the Downtown Alliance will award a research grant. This area has a lot of residents and tourists and residential garbage pick-up is an issue. We are continuing to advocate to the City and the Department of Transportation for transportation studies and analyses of this area. Finally, many of the proposed super tall developments in Manhattan Community Board 1 are as-of-right and some are eligible for bonuses in exchange for transportation improvements.

Borough President Report, Gale A. Brewer, Manhattan Borough President:

The closure of small businesses and supermarkets in Manhattan is an ongoing concern. The Commercial Rent Tax if a factor in this phenomenon and it applies only in Manhattan to businesses between Chambers Street and 96th Street. Council Member Garodnick's bill, which would change the number of small businesses between Chambers and 96th Street that are required to pay the Commercial Rent Tax, will have a hearing in the City Council this fall. I have also proposed a bill to abolish the Commercial Rent Tax for all supermarkets. Both bills could benefit from resolutions expressing support if your boards think it is appropriate to consider them. Vacant storefronts are another issue facing small businesses. My office found 188 vacant storefronts along Broadway alone and, at REBNY the other day, this came up as a topic. REBNY may not like any of my suggestions, but REBNY is concerned about this too. I am not sure how much of it is because of online shopping and how much of it is because of the challenges that Terri and Jamie described, but I think we need more discussion and analysis on this topic. We can look at land use and zoning as tools to address this. To address the lack of analysis on this phenomenon, my understanding is that, in the fall, the Department of City Planning with do an official analysis of the Upper West Side Special Business District that I helped to create as a council member. My office, my staff, and I are trying to address this issue on every level. We are also working on food policy and staff and volunteers are visiting Title I schools tomorrow to distribute flyers that have summer meals sites for those under 18 listed for each Manhattan school district. My office, my staff and I are also working really hard on the subway issue. I love Richard Ravitch. He was the former head of the subways. He doesn't mince words. He said "signals, Gale, signals." So I asked the Independent Budget Office to do an analysis and estimate when the MTA will complete the modernization of the signal system it depends upon. The Independent Budget Office found that the signal modernization project is on pace to be completed by 2045 and will require another $20 billion. We can have long conversations on congestion pricing to fund this, but the Mayor said today he will not consider it and the Governor also said he will not consider it. I don't know where the $20 billion required to complete the project will come from, but I do know that it needs to come sooner than 2045 because the signal system is the heart of the subway. You can't see it and it's not a shiny car so nobody gets excited about it. However, it needs to be modernized in order to improve subway service, according to the guru of the subway, Richard Ravitch. My office will hold a community board training on Friday, June 23rd at John Jay College. However, we are also going to find a Saturday because a lot of board members cannot take off time from work. My office held a senior brain health symposium in March of 2016 and 1,020 people showed up. It was an unbelievable turnout, so we are holding a caregiver symposium on July 23rd at Fordham. My staff and I have also met with DCAS about your community board office and meeting space concerns. My staff will send each community board a breakdown of the projects that my office has selected for CAP funding. Finally, we have wonderful

interns this summer. They are always integral to the office's work so I am excited to be working with them.

Council Member Updates:

Jasmine Askew, Community Aide, Council Member Mendez's Office: We understand that both Manhattan Community Board 3 and Manhattan Community Board 6's Transportation Committee meetings were attended by the MTA who presented on the L train shutdown. The MTA will be constructing a new L train entrance on 14th Street and Avenue A and they will be doing construction on 14th Street between Avenue A and Avenue B and that this will impact residents and businesses so we want to make sure that the MTA briefed community boards and elected officials on the plan.

A motion to adjourn was adopted at 10:12am.