



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

SUMMARY REPORT OF THE MANHATTAN BOROUGH BOARD

October 20th, 2016

In Attendance:

Presiding: Aldrin Bonilla, Deputy Borough President for Community Affairs and Constituent Services; Lucille Songhai, Director of Community Affairs; Diana Howard, Community Liaison; Drew Lombardi, Community Liaison; Yissely Ortiz, Community Liaison

Council Members: Vincent Fang (representing Hon. Margaret Chin); Vanessa Diaz-Lopez (representing Hon. Rosie Mendez); Cory Epstein (representing Hon. Daniel Garodnick); Jake Spom (representing Hon. Mark Levine); Lermond Mayes (representing Hon. Inez Dickens)

Community Boards: Anthony Notaro, Jr. (CB 1); Tobi Bergman (CB 2); Jamie Rogers (CB 3); Jesse Bodine (representing Delores Rubin) (CB 4); Nicholas Athanail (representing Vikki Barbero) (CB 5); Rick Eggers (CB 6); Roberta Semer (representing Elizabeth Caputo) (CB 7); Jim Clynes (CB 8); Padmore John, accompanied by Joel Mentor, Jr. (CB 9); Brian Benjamin (CB 10); Diane Collier, accompanied by Marie Winfield (CB 11); Shahabuddeen Ally, accompanied by Gerard Dengel (CB 12)

Minutes: Morris Chan, Community Liaison

Agenda for October 20th, 2016 Borough Board – Adopted
Minutes for September 15th, 2016 Borough Board – Adopted

Presentation: Data Mapping and Visualization with www.data2go.nyc (SSRC)

Presenter: Sarah Burd-Sharps, Co-Director, Measure of America

The one-stop open data portal www.data2go.nyc is part of Measure of America, an initiative launched by Social Science Research Council a year ago to focus on metrics related to the well-being, social access and critical quality-of-life factors. This portal hosts all data directed related to New York City at the Community Board level. All available data will be fully uploaded and available by Veterans Day this year.

New York City is known to be data rich. Development of civic technology stimulates the needs and the demand for ever more data. The one-stop portal is here to assist the community to address gaps in available civic data tools. By putting relevant data



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

all in one place, www.data2go.nyc helps users to visualize correlations between various factors. For example, putting health, crime and environmental data together helps to demonstrate that the likelihood of eating breakfast every day is correlated with the crime rate and a number of public health indicators. The portal has all data organized at the Community Board level, which allows consistent comparison for all the information in one single geographic unit.

This project is funded by Helmsley Charitable Trust for the duration of five years. It has data for 360 indicators available at the Community Board level, of which 150 also exist at the census tract level. For example, it shows that the census tract with the highest Gini coefficient is located in East Harlem. It has a mapping tool organized by 12 categories on well-being and opportunities. Each category consists of a number of indicators; for example, “food system” category includes indicators on hunger, dietary behavior, food resources and food philanthropy. User can visualize all 360 categories broken down by 12 categories on the dashboard, remove ones not in use from screen view, click to reveal sources and move displays around. Dashboard mapping tool allows user to identify locations of various facilities and click on the pin drop to reveal facility information. The portal is user-friendly and presumes that little methodology is needed. It maps all figures with higher prevalence in a darker color, whether positive or negative.

The portal continues to incorporate new datasets and features. Measure of America has recently obtained the release of Community Health Profile dataset for all 59 Community Boards; it has enabled visualization of child asthma hospitalization and its associated inequality. Portal now includes 17 “features of interest” overlaying schools, supermarkets and other service facilities on its maps. It has also mapped all New York City Housing Authority development locations and includes site-specific data for all public housing estates. This information has allowed visualization of high child asthma hospitalization as highly correlated with public housing estates.

All data except for philanthropic indicators are available for download in MS Excel or CSV formats. User may share data-generated unique dashboard map via social media and mobile device screenshot. User may search for indicators desired and overlay them on the mapping tool. For example, one may overlay the number of 311 complaints in a year atop locally undesirable land use (LULU) locations. Dataset takes into consideration the great disparities of 311 complaint calls across districts.

Portal data employs a number of definitions, such as 13,000 ft² minimum for any food establishment to be considered a supermarket. This information is critical in demonstrating that Staten Island has a reduced supermarket coverage compared to



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

other boroughs. Measure of America team is also active in soliciting agency approval to resolve data privacy concerns to obtain and release data to the public. It has now obtained data from the Admin. for Children's Services; the data illustrate that share of disconnected youth varies from community to community, with 27% in CB 10 and less than 4% in CB 7. It has entered Board of Elections data into geographic information system overlaid on New York City Community Board map. The data here show that only about 50% of registered voters in CB 8 and 41% in CB 6 voted at least once in the last three years, which usually include a presidential election.

The www.data2go.nyc portal is meant to display correlations and detach *in situ* data from the usual agency parameters to enable further investigations. One may select from over 30 indicators for the x-axis and the y-axis for plotting purposes. Variables are arranged in a curated and proven matter. For example, plotting helps to show that health insurance coverage, unlike unemployment and consumption of sugary drinks, does not have statistically significant relationship with life expectancy. User must note, however, that correlation does not mean causation. It only shows that a relationship is strong enough to warrant further exploration.

Athanail (CB 5): Can this portal add information on 311 complaints and addresses of State Liquor Authority bar and restaurant licenses?

Burd-Sharps (SSRC): Project team will look into this suggestion.

Collier (CB 11): Could there be any more data on child protection and child abuse?

Burd-Sharps (SSRC): It is a more difficult process given privacy concerns. Measure of America is mostly only able to gather foster care, abuse and well-being indicators, not individual specific data figures.

John (CB 9): How will it differ for data collected in-house vs. data collected from other sources? Federal Dept. of Justice has announced that it will begin collecting police shooting data. Can the portal upload this information?

Deputy Borough President Bonilla: Borough President Brewer has been working on this initiative as well. It involves confidentiality concerns and lawsuits, and similar obstacles exist for Civilian Complaint Review Board data.

Burd-Sharps (SSRC): There is limited amount of data on police. It is mostly medical incidents, incarceration rates and crime statistics. Project team has been working with Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice for over a year to obtain data. Police is now



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

implementing CompStat 2.0 and has information on felonies in each Community Board. The team will have to map and code the information geographically. It is also an area involving confidentiality of difficult and sensitive information. To have data will enable decisions and allow some concerns to fade.

Bodine (CB 4): Data should be front and center in Community Board budget process and member trainings. Is the plotting and overlay interface planner-friendly? Does the portal connect data to City findings and research? Can it help to connect issues with budget allocated, especially on amount spent and specific spending? Does the dataset contain figures on homelessness, or is it only a crude overall number by each Community Board due to privacy reasons?

Dengel (CB 12): How often are the data updated?

Burd-Sharps (SSRC): Project aims to update data annually, with mid-year updates if necessary. For example, school graduation rate data come mid-year at the time of graduation itself, classified by the Community Board where students begin their day. It is the "how and where" on budget and spending that is the less transparent. The team was only able to obtain statement of district needs and budget requests in PDF documents. A lot of the Community Boards do not have complete information as well. Portal interface allows for scaling by each indicator for planning use. As for data on homelessness, the team has been working with the Dept. of Homeless Services and has been able to obtain data on homeless children per 1,000, families entering shelter per 1,000 by shelter location and number of 311 complaints.

Eggers (CB 6): This portal has an amount of Community Board-based data like never before and could make using Census data a much better experience. Is this portal also compatible with mobile phones and tablets?

Burd-Sharps (SSRC): Project team will be able to make presentation to any group over 20. The grant funding did stipulate outreach as a condition. Data are only as good as their sources. Portal is available in full version on tablets, but the mobile phone website contains only a reduced version, based on current location.

Winfield (CB 11): Does it capture data on the undocumented and on idNYC?

Burd-Sharps (SSRC): Dataset from the Admin. for Children's Services does include statistics from the undocumented. It is obvious that data related to this population are difficult to come by. The data available are not specific to the undocumented, but are organized based on foreign birth and foreign language spoken.



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

John (CB 9): Can there be a conversation with elected officials and stakeholders on requesting data and working with agencies to secure data?

Mentor (CB 9): Is there a plan to develop application programming interface (API)?

Rogers (CB 3): Is there anything Community Board can do to speed up the data funnel, as statements of district needs and budget requests are still in PDF only?

Burd-Sharps (SSRC): The request will be more robust if Community Boards come up with the demand for data. Negotiation, mapping, coding and release to the public are altogether a long process. Project team initially aimed at 100% API data, only to find that it slows down response time. The portal is a data firehose, not easily workable. Project team hopes to have district-level data in MS Excel format. It is working with Mayor's Office of Data Analytics to make all data electronic, sortable, interactive and overlaid on Community Boards, plus a fully sortable and sharable data template.

Semer (CB 7): Does the dataset include traffic accidents and incidents? CB 7 is so far only able to be reactive on this front. Police files report with the State, not the City, and it will take forever for the investigation to conclude to see the report. There is no way to find out what happened. The report may state reasons for the accident or the incident, but it will say just about nothing else.

Deputy Borough President Bonilla: Is the issue due to insurance claims reasons?

Bodine (CB 4): Police does have limited data. CB 4 requested additional technology to help processing data faster at borough budget consultations this year.

Deputy Borough President Bonilla: How does the portal address data at Public Use Microdata Area (PUMA) level, which aggregates CB 1 with CB 2 and CB 5 with CB 4?

Burd-Sharps (SSRC): These are amongst the few PUMAs that are not coterminous with the Community Board. Project team had to devote a lot of time to segregate the data. As mentioned, full data will be available by Veterans Day.

Office of Borough President Report

Community Affairs Director Songhai: Borough President Brewer testified at the hearing on street festival rules. Thanks for all the feedbacks, as they became the basis of the testimony that raised question on festival cap, 50% local vendor rule and new fee structure. Hearing was packed with festival organizers seeking to



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

speaking, with overflow rooms to seat the crowd. Comment deadline remains October 27th; all Community Boards should adopt resolution or send letter for the record in the interest of broad consensus on the issue. Borough President Brewer testified in support of Intro 179, in relation to visible address number on buildings, on public safety grounds. Community Board application for 2017 is scheduled to go live mid-November. Office is still speaking with all chairs and district managers on skillset needs, public housing representation and expanded youth membership. Please speak to community liaisons on recommendations for particular individuals to apply. Office hopes to strengthen land use expertise by recruiting professionals in the field to serve. Borough President Brewer testified on Intro 214, in support of right to legal counsel at housing court for low-income tenants. All testimonies are posted on the website. City has contracts with foreign language and sign language translation and interpretation services. Some Community Boards may have need for the hearing impaired or the non-English speaking. In particular, office will speak with Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs on resources for Spanish translation, given the demand. City has the equipment. How is it deployed? How can Community Boards use the service? Borough President Brewer will moderate a forum on street homelessness on October 25th. Office will host a small business event, with Office of Administrative Trials and Hearings, on October 28th at Harlem State Office Building.

Deputy Borough President Bonilla: Office encourages Community Board members and applicants to attend Community Board Leadership Development Series.

Bodine (CB 4): CB 4 found that Dept. of Citywide Administrative Services holds the contract for interpretation via telephone. It is also the service employed for 311 calls in non-English languages. Can Community Boards "piggyback" onto this contract? CB 4 has seen applicants agreeing to stipulations not understanding the content. No interpreter is required to be physically present.

Council Member Reports

CM Garodnick: Member introduced Intro 1300, which will require that the Dept. of Environmental Protection post all noise mitigation plans on its website. Office will host additional NYC Rent Freeze events. Office will host bike helmet fitting event on October 22nd at 11:00 AM at CUNY Hunter College.

Community Board Reports

Community Board 1: CB 1 will adopt a resolution on deed restrictions, in support of Borough President Brewer's efforts. Next Lower Manhattan Coastal Resiliency



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

task force meeting will take place in early December; the meeting will examine a number of preliminary designs. Community Boards supplement their budgets with proceeds from street festivals, and many neighborhood non-profits do the same; all remain concerned over the proposed street festival rules. CB 1 states for the record that gaining traction with the Dept. of Buildings has been particularly difficult in case of complaints requiring immediate attention. An incident took place where construction tool fell off the building; agency inspector came only two weeks later.

Community Board 2: CB 2 has a policy on street co-naming applications, in which the individual must be deceased and must had nexus with the neighborhood where the street is located. This protocol eliminates almost all co-naming applications, and CB 2 is happy to work with other Community Boards to share its experience. CB 2 will conduct a walking tour of Astor Place plaza with CB 3 shortly. Applications for enclosed sidewalk café are again on the rise. CB 2 was able to work with the area Council Member to block two such applications, but legislation is needed to prevent enclosed café from encroaching sidewalk. City Council is moving fast with vendor legislation package and leaving no time for Community Board to hold meetings and adopt resolutions. Vendor issue differs from one neighborhood to another; some would like to see more vendors on immigrant economic entry grounds, while others find them obstructing sidewalk. Vendor licenses are often in the hands of corrupt contractors or commissaries. Community Boards would like to have time to weigh in on the issue. Pier 40 and Water Tunnel No. 3 shaft sites are the inter-generational issues on deck at CB 2. Pier 40 development rights transfer application is before the City Council. Then-Mayor Bloomberg pledged to have shaft sites “hidden in plain sight” as parks, but Mayor de Blasio intended to leave them as inaccessible secured sites at one point. All Community Boards should identify water tunnel shaft sites in their districts; CB 2 is planning to request \$1 million each for the Dept. of Parks and Recreation for its three sites to enable their construction and operation as parks.

Community Board 3: CB 3 continues to have concerns over the planned service reduction at the Mt. Sinai Beth Israel Medical Center. Two Bridges has seen a sharp increase in the number of super-tall skyscraper projects. Dept. of City Planning is requiring environmental impact statement for such proposals; CB 3 will constitute a task force to steer the process. CB 3 will adopt its FY 2018 budget priorities at its general board meeting on October 31st.

Community Board 4: CB 4 took part in the Port Authority Bus Terminal meeting on October 18th. The meeting did provide some clarifications, and CB 4 heard that the design and delivery competition is almost complete. CB 4 believes that the process is flawed and calls for a thorough process with “all options” by geographical area on



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

the table, with no use of eminent domain. CB 4 hopes to see more discussion on funding, consultant selection and planning process. CB 4 heard the presentation on the proposed street festival rules on October 18th; whether there will be a resolution or a letter remains uncertain. Many business improvement districts (BIDs) and community-based organizations (CBOs) have concerns, especially as many festivals in CB 4 are one-of-its-kind unique events incompatible with the 50% local vendor requirement. CB 4 could use more single-block festivals and would like to see fewer street festivals on Eighth Avenue and Ninth Avenue. Street vendor legislations will be up for City Council hearing on October 26th; CB 4 is taking on the issue via its Executive in the hope that it could adopt something in time to testify. The package will create more permits, set up a vendor board and establish enforcement office; it is a lot of change requiring rapid turnaround. Empire State Development Corp. will hold the public hearing on Penn Station proposals on November 2nd.

Community Board 5: Port Authority Bus Terminal remains the main issue on deck. Dept. of Homeless Services and Breaking Ground will be hosting a forum on street homelessness on October 25th; thanks to Borough President Brewer for agreeing to moderate the event. CB 5 adopted resolution, with a detailed report, recommending interior landmark designation for Waldorf Astoria Hotel.

Community Board 6: CB 6 had its annual election of officers at the recent general board meeting. CB 6 adopted resolution in support of legislative solutions for deed restriction issue, in line with Borough President Brewer and its elected officials. CB 6 will send a letter serving as comment for the street festival rules proposal. Lots of area CBOs sponsors festivals; CB 6 itself sponsors two as well. The 50% local vendor requirement and the application schedule are not workable. CB 6 adopted its FY 2018 budget priorities. CB 6 office moved; it is now at Suite 326A within the same building. CB 6 will take part in the Mt. Sinai Beth Israel Medical Center forum; it has led to land use and Lower Manhattan medical service access concerns.

Community Board 7: CB 7 is home to a synagogue that is not a landmark and has seriously deteriorating interior. Congregation is seeking to sell the building in return for ground-floor sanctuary space. CB 7 did not arrive at a resolution on this application at the committee level. This case follows an incident in which another synagogue, a designated landmark, was demolished under “minor” modification approved by the Board of Standards and Appeals. The case will return to CB 7 next month, and discussion is likely to hinge on development rights transfer. American Museum of Natural History appeared at the committee level this month; CB 7 will adopt resolution in support of the application. School re-zoning has been the fight in the Community School District 3 area as of late. Dept. of Parks and Recreation will



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

come at the committee level to present on the Riverside Park bike lane proposal, from West 72nd Street to West 89th Street.

Community Board 8: CB 8 campaign to make Queensboro Oval public is ongoing. It should be a full-time, year-round public facility, not a private “bubble” for a tennis club for nine months of the year. CB 8 hopes to meet with Commissioner Silver in December to discuss the issue. CB 8 thanks elected officials and CB 6 for the support on this campaign. Pedestrian fatality in CB 8 more than doubled in the past four years. Is it a combination of elderly population, vehicular congestion, inattention by drivers and bicycle proliferation? CB 8 will hold a pedestrian safety forum at a later date. *New York Times* published a list of “unofficial mayors of Manhattan” and selected CB 8 member Barry Schneider and his wife Judith.

Community Board 9: CB 9 will adopt FY 2018 budget priorities on October 24th. CB 9 finds that Dept. of Transportation improvements along Broadway not effective for the district and not enhancing safety; community has started conversations seeking to revert to the original design. CB 9 continues to work with housing development fund corporations (HDFCs) to provide information and assistance; the committee in charge of this effort has been working diligently on the matter. CB 9 hopes to train a cohort of its members and staff to assist in the effort. Holiday lighting ceremony is scheduled for November 17th. Boys & Girls Club on West 145th Street opens today; community is pleased to see the former PS 186, vacant for over 30 years, now in use.

Community Board 10: CB 10 created a youth task force; Victoria Pannell, the teen member on CB 10, is leading the effort. Pannell is also working on gathering donated supplies and coordinating delivery to Haiti in response to Hurricane Matthew. CB 10 will conduct fundraising to pay for Pannell’s travels. CB 10 is also going to launch a public cleanliness campaign with local BID and the Dept. of Sanitation in response to the proliferation of dirty streets in the district. CB 10 is happy to work with other Community Boards to share the experience. CB 10 received over 20 requests for street co-naming and is now reviewing its procedures on the matter, especially as approval or denial of such requests are known to be controversial. CB 10 hopes to come up with a robust process for all future co-naming applications.

Community Board 11: Dept. of City Planning revealed the re-zoning framework component in the East Harlem Neighborhood Plan at the committee level. It was a great presentation but a highly technical one as well. CB 11 will engage in follow-up meetings and discussions on the matter. CB 11 remains in support of the spirit of this proposal, but with concerns. CB 11 will hold “East Harlem Housing Today” forum on October 22nd at 9:30 AM at CUNY Hunter College. CB 11 thanks the



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN

members of its Land Use, Landmarks & Planning committee for the effort on the MTA East 126th Street bus depot and African burial ground.

Community Board 12: CB 12 deliberated on FY 2018 budget priorities at the committee level last night and will vote to adopt the item at the general board meeting next week. CB 12 took part in the New York Legal Assistance Group mobile legal van service event yesterday. This effort helped to bring legal services to the community; Community Boards should reach out to this organization to solicit opportunities to have mobile legal aid. CB 12 is now reviewing application for a hotel-office mixed-use project at West 181st Street and Amsterdam Avenue. CB 12 held a meeting with DOT Manhattan Borough Commissioner Forgione; much of the discussion focused on Dyckman Street bike lane, which has left the street with one lane in each direction to cope with the traffic from its bar and restaurant scene. CB 12 finds the issue a matter of enforcement. How could the City enforce against violations taking place at 2:00 AM on the weekend? Would it mean that bike lanes will receive cameras, similar to bus lanes?

Borough Board adjourned.