



OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

1 Centre Street, 19th floor, New York, NY 10007
(212) 669-8300 p (212) 669-4306 f
431 West 125th Street, New York, NY 10027
(212) 531-1609 p (212) 531-4615 f
www.manhattanbp.nyc.gov

Gale A. Brewer, Borough President

January 24, 2018

**Recommendation on ULURP Application C 180069 ZSM – 21 East 12th Street
By 21E12, LLC.**

PROPOSED ACTION

Broome 21E12, LLC¹ (“the applicant”) seeks a special permit pursuant to Sections 13-45 and 13-451 of the Zoning Resolution (“ZR”) to allow an attended public parking garage with a maximum capacity of 187 spaces on portions of the ground floor, cellar and subcellar of a proposed mixed-use building located at 21 East 12th Street (Block 570, Lots 1101 and 1102), partially within a C1-7 and a C6-1 zoning district in Community Board 2, Manhattan.

Pursuant to ZR § 13-45, the City Planning Commission (“CPC”) must find that:

- 1) The location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not unduly interrupt the flow of pedestrian traffic associated with uses or public facilities, including access points to mass transit facilities in close proximity thereto, or result in any undue conflict between pedestrian and vehicular movements, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- 2) The location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not interfere with the efficient functioning of streets, including any lanes designated for specific types of users or vehicles, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- 3) Such use will not create or contribute to serious traffic congestion and will not unduly inhibit surface traffic and pedestrian flow;
- 4) For public parking garages, where any floor space is exempted from the definition of floor area, such additional floor space is needed in order to prevent excessive on-street parking demand and relieve traffic congestion; and
- 5) Such parking facility will not be inconsistent with the character of the existing streetscape.

Pursuant to § 13-451, the CPC may permit a parking facility listed in Section 13-45(a), where such parking facility serves the parking needs of a predominately residential development or enlargement, provided that, in addition to the conditions and findings set forth in Section 13-45, the Commission shall find that:

The number of off-street parking spaces in such proposed parking facility is reasonable and not excessive in relation to recent trends in close proximity to the proposed facility with regard to:

¹ 21E12 LLC was established in 2015 and is represented by William Macklowe of the William Macklowe Company.

- 1) The increase in the number of dwelling units; and
- 2) The numbers of both public and accessory off-street parking spaces, taking into account both the construction, if any, of new off-street parking facilities and the reduction, if any, in the number of such spaces in existing parking facilities. In making this determination, the Commission may take into account off-street parking facilities for which building permits have been granted, or which have obtained CPC special permits pursuant to Section 13-45; ...

The CPC may also prescribe appropriate conditions and safeguards to minimize adverse effects on the character of the surrounding area under the special permit.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant seeks a special permit pursuant to ZR § 13-45 and 13-451 to increase the permitted capacity of an attended parking facility from 13 accessory parking spaces to 187 public parking spaces. The project site's lot area is 19,085 square feet in area with 176 square feet of frontage along University Place and 108 square feet of frontage on East 12th Street.

Background

The development site was formerly occupied by a four-story building operated by Bowlmor Lanes, one of the city's oldest bowling alleys on the upper floors, with retail use on the ground floor and a 200-space parking garage licensed by the New York City Department of Consumer Affairs. The applicant purchased the building in 2012 and demolished the building in 2014. The site is currently under construction.

Proposed Development

The applicant is currently constructing an as-of-right 23-story mixed-use building consisting of 122,465 square feet of floor area. The building will contain 53 residential units, 12,770 square feet of retail floor area, 1,030 square feet of community facility floor area, and 24,150 square feet of parking surface on the sub cellar and cellar levels of the building for total of 187 spaces permitted by special permit only. The parking facility would contain 134 surface parking spaces and 53 parking spaces provided on trays.

The proposed parking facility entrance would be accessible by an 18.5 foot wide curb cut located on East 12th Street and approximately 83 feet west of University Place. As proposed, the parking facility has a two-way vehicular ramp; the inbound lane and ramp would consist of 10 reservoir parking spaces where upon arrival at the cellar level, garage patrons would leave their vehicles with a parking attendant. From there, the garage patrons would take the elevator to the building's lobby if they are residents or to the street level if they are members of the public or going to the street. The exit ramp would have a one-foot wide, two inches tall speed bump and a stop sign located four feet from the street line.

Area Context

The project site is located partially within a C1-7 and partially within a C6-1 zoning district in the Greenwich Village neighborhood. The majority of the project site falls within the C1-7 zoning district which permits Use Groups (UG) 1 through 6 and UG 14. The C1-7 zoning

district is an R8 equivalent and permits Floor Area Ratio (FAR) for residential use of 3.44 and 2.0 FAR for commercial floor area use. The C6-1 zoning district has an R7-2 district equivalent, permits UG 6-12 and permits a commercial FAR of 6.0 and a residential FAR of 2.0. This zoning district covers the site's mid-block, west of the project site. The C1-6 zoning district extends south of the site and to the east side of University Place.

The project site is located just two blocks south of the Union Square Special District, which was established in 1985 to promote a revitalized mixed-use area around Union Square Park by providing ground floor retail space and improved access, visibility and security at the park. The site is surrounded by low-rise and mid-rise buildings with several commercial uses: restaurants, bars, fitness facilities and small shops. There are also several institutional uses: The New School, Parsons School of Design, First Presbyterian Church, Cardozo School of Law and New York University School of Professional Studies.

The project site is well served by mass transit. Two blocks north of the site is access to the 14th Street Union Square station – the fourth busiest subway stop in the city serving over 100,000 riders daily – which is serviced by the N/Q/ R/W, L, and Nos. 4/5/6 subway lines. The area is also served by the PATH train west of the project site at Sixth Avenue at both 9th Street and 14th Street. There are also several bus lines north of the project site at East 14th Street including the M14A and M14D; the X1, X10, X10B, and X17 bus lines can be accessed one block east of the site along Broadway. Just west of the site at Fifth Avenue is access to the M1, M2, M3 and M55 bus lines. There are also four Citibike stations located within a one block radius of the site.

Proposed Actions

The applicant seeks a Parking Special Permit pursuant to ZR § 13-45 and 13-451 to allow additional accessory parking spaces for residential growth in order to construct a 187-space attended public parking garage. Only 13 accessory spaces are permitted as-of-right for the building and the permit would allow for 174 additional parking spaces.

COMMUNITY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

At its Full Board meeting on December 21, 2017, Manhattan Community Board 2 (CB2) voted by a vote of 30 in the affirmative, 4 in the negative, in favor of a resolution recommending denial of the application. The resolution states the Board opposed the 2013 Manhattan Core Amendment and at that time, recommended a limit of 50 parking spaces in any new residential development parking garage. In the resolution, CB2 raises further concerns including that parking prices could increase for monthly parking spaces to create spaces for daily, hourly, or monthly parking for employees; opposition to all massive new office and residential development along the University Place and 4th Avenue corridor including this building; that the parking facility will encourage more commuters and shoppers to the area and contribute adversely to traffic and pedestrian flow; that the traffic study radius was insufficient in capturing the number of potential vehicles commuting into the area. CB2's Traffic and Transportation Committee performed their own survey and found monthly parking spots available in the vicinity of the site and stated that during a conversation with a Vice President of a large parking company, they were told that parking occupancy is low because millennials do not own cars and instead use Uber. The Board also surveyed the area with a mobile app and determined there are

33 parking garages in the neighborhood and project site vicinity that provide monthly space for \$500 and a few with hourly. The Board resolution also states there is sufficient off-street monthly parking in the area and expressed a concern over the possibility of short-term commuter and retail parking in the garage. The resolution further stipulates that if the City Planning Commission considers more parking spaces than currently permitted, that the capacity should not exceed the 53 dwelling unit count and should be used exclusively for the residents or a combination of residents and car share spaces in addition to 38 permanent bike stations for monthly rental use.

BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S COMMENTS

Recommendations from this office on prior parking special permits have requested that the Department of City Planning and the City Planning Commission consider a more robust set of factors aside from the existing parking methodology analysis. These factors include the absolute availability of parking, the supply of parking prior to the ten-year look-back and the current capacity and utilization rate of parking facilities in the neighborhood, as well as access to mass transit. These factors should be considered where applicable.

The applicant is proposing a 187-space public parking garage for a new mixed-use luxury residential building. Thirteen of these spaces are as-of-right. The applicant team stated they would encourage monthly users from the neighborhood by offering a discount for the first year and would provide a 30-day notice for transient users in favor of locals. Although the applicant argues that the net loss of parking during the ten-year look back exceeds 750 parking spaces on this project block site alone, the absence of new large parking facilities in newly constructed residential buildings in the neighborhood leads my office to believe goals of the Manhattan Core text is working in this neighborhood.

In previous applications seeking an increase to the number of parking spaces allowed as-of-right, we begrudgingly recommended approval for minimal parking at a one to one ratio for residential use only. However, because of the proposed size of this facility and proximity to a major transit hub at Union Square, my office finds only the permitted number of parking spaces appropriate at this site.

BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S RECOMMENDATION

Therefore, the Manhattan Borough President recommends denial of the ULURP application C 180069 ZSM for a parking special permit for 187 spaces.



Gale A. Brewer
Manhattan Borough President